

---

# CONTENTS

---

## VOLUME I

Preface *xxi*

Acknowledgements *xxix*

Glossary of Terms and Acronyms *xxxv*

### PART ONE INTRODUCTION

#### 1 Introduction 3

The Accident 3

The Initial Investigation 3

Interpretation of Terms of Reference 4

Aviation Accident Investigation: The System Approach 4

The Components of the Commercial Air Transportation System 6

The Aircraft Crew 6

Captain George Morwood 6

First Officer Keith Mills 7

Flight Attendant Katherine Say 7

Flight Attendant Sonia Hartwick 7

The Aircraft 8

The Carrier: Air Ontario Inc. 8

The Regulator: Transport Canada 9

Carrier's Obligation and Regulator's Duty 10

### PART TWO FACTS SURROUNDING THE CRASH OF FLIGHT 1363

#### 2 Air Ontario Flights 1362 and 1363 15

Winnipeg 15

The Weather, Fuel and Passenger Loads, Aircraft Weight 15

The Flight Release 16  
The Unserviceable Auxiliary Power Unit 17  
Departure From Winnipeg 18  
First Dryden Station Stop 19  
Thunder Bay Station Stop 20

**3 Dryden Municipal Airport and Air Ontario Facilities,  
March 10, 1989 22**

Dryden Municipal Airport 22  
Equipment and On-Duty Personnel 22  
Runways 23  
Approved Runway Lighting 23  
Weather Minima 24  
Navigation Aids and Landing Limits 24  
Dryden Flight Centre 24  
Other Services 25  
De-icing 25  
Weather Services 26  
Air Traffic Control 26

**4 Meteorological Information 28**

Aviation Weather Information 28  
Types of Weather Information Available 28  
Significance of Weather Information 29  
Weather Information for March 10, 1989 30  
Synopsis 30  
General Weather 30  
Area Forecast 30  
Winnipeg (YWG) Weather 33  
Dryden (YHD) Weather 36  
Eyewitness Weather Information for Dryden 38  
Thunder Bay (YQT) Weather 41  
Sault Ste Marie (YAM) Weather 44  
Runway Visual Range 44  
General Description 44  
Operational Use of RVR 45  
RVR Equipment at the Dryden Airport 45  
Visibility Comparisons: RVR and Meteorological Observations 46  
Visibility at Dryden, 1809Z (12:09 p.m.) 46  
Summary of the Evidence 46  
Findings 47

---

**5 Events and Circumstances at the Dryden Municipal Airport  
Preceding Takeoff 49**

Condition of Runway on Landing 49

Hot Refuelling 52

Concurrent Events 53

    Captain Morwood's Call to System Operations Control 54

    Evidence of Ms Mary Ward and Mr Wayne Copeland 55

    Evidence of and Related to Ms Jill Brannan 56

    Evidence of Captain Keith Fox and Ms Carol Petrocovich 58

Later Events at the Terminal 62

Role of the Cessna 150 Aircraft 64

Eyewitness Observations of Precipitation 68

    Ramp Area 68

    Wings 70

        Observations of Mr Vaughan Cochrane 71

    Waiting for the Cessna 150 74

Findings 75

    Landing at Dryden 75

    At the Dryden Terminal 75

    Accumulation of Snow on the Wings while Aircraft at Gate 77

    Waiting for the Cessna 150 77

**6 Circumstances Related to the Takeoff and Crash of Flight 1363 79**

The Takeoff Roll – Condition of Aircraft 79

The Takeoff – Eyewitness Observations 84

Runway Conditions before and after Takeoff 87

    Observations Shortly after the F-28 Takeoff 89

Findings 91

**7 The Crash and the Response 93**

The Crash 93

    Crash Fire Rescue Response at the Terminal 94

    At the Air Ontario Counter 95

    At the Scene 95

Crew and Passenger Injuries 97

The Afternoon of March 10 97

Removal of the Bodies 99

Finding 100

## **8 Dryden Area Response 101**

Emergency Services 101

Mutual Aid 101

The Emergency Plan 102

Town of Dryden Police Dispatch 104

Dryden Ambulance Service 104

Preparing for an Emergency 104

The Dryden Airport 104

Exercises Involving Crash, Fire-fighting, and Rescue 106

Town of Dryden 111

Observations 111

The Emergency, March 10, 1989 113

Implementing the Emergency Plan 113

Chief Maltais and the Dryden Fire Department 114

The UT of O Fire Department 115

The Ontario Provincial Police 115

Dryden Ambulance Service 116

Response Times 117

At the Scene 117

On-Site Coordinator 117

Communications 120

Fire Suppression 122

Provision of the Passenger List 125

Other Dryden Agencies and Businesses 126

Findings 127

Recommendations 131

## **PART THREE CRASH, FIRE-FIGHTING, AND RESCUE SERVICES**

### **9 Dryden Municipal Airport Crash, Fire-fighting, and Rescue Services 135**

Legislation and Policies Governing Dryden Municipal Airport and Its CFR Services 135

Background of Dryden Municipal Airport and CFR Services 137

Dryden Airport Category and CFR Services 141

Airport Categorization 141

Level of Protection 141

Dryden Airport CFR Services 142

Role of the Dryden CFR Unit 143

CFR Response Areas 145

Critical Rescue and Fire-fighting Access Area (CRFAA) 146

Dryden Airport CFR Unit on March 10, 1989 149

Fuelling Procedures at Dryden	149
Crash Gate Access Roads	157
Activities of CFR Fire-fighters	159
Initial Response by CFR Unit to the Crash	161
Fire Chief Parry	162
Crew Chief Kruger	163
Fire-fighter Rivard	166
Use of Fire-fighting Equipment Available at the Crash	167
Experts' Views of CFR Activities March 10, 1989	173
Mr Brian Boucher	173
Mr Jeffrey Hamilton	173
Mr Larry O'Bray	174
Aircraft Crash Charts	175
Training and Proficiency of Dryden CFR Unit Personnel	181
Transport Canada Training Policy	181
Dryden Airport Management Training Policy	186
Transport Canada-Subsidized Airport Policy	189
Enforceability of Agreements	194
CFR Services: The Issue of Safety	196
CFR Assessment by Transport Canada and Dryden Authorities	199
Observations	205
Findings	209
Recommendations	213

## **PART FOUR AIRCRAFT INVESTIGATION PROCESS AND ANALYSIS**

### **10 Technical Investigation 219**

The Aircraft and Its Systems	219
Conduct of the Investigation	219
Initial Investigative Activity and Observations	221
Engines	223
Number 1 (Left) Engine	223
Number 2 (Right) Engine	225
Engine Accessories	226
Oil Analysis	226
Fuel Analysis	227
Metal Spatter Analysis and Engine Power	227
Engine Assessment by Rolls-Royce	230
Engine Assessment by Mr Peter Clay	230
Engine Sounds at Takeoff from Dryden	232
Witness Description	232
Analysis of Engine Sounds	236

Engine Smoke on Startup at Winnipeg	237
Description of Occurrence	237
Analysis of the Engine Smoke	238
Evaluation of Engine Condition	239
Engine Power	239
Engine Anti-Ice	240
Auxiliary Power Unit	240
Systems	242
Hydraulic System	242
Landing-Gear System	243
Wheels and Wheel-Brake System	244
Electrical System	244
Fuel System	245
Fire-Protection System	246
Bleed-Air Supply System	246
Ice- and Rain-Protection Systems	247
Air-Conditioning System	248
Instrument Systems	248
Indicator Lights	249
Radio and Navigation Systems	250
Flight Controls	250
Primary Flight Controls	250
Gust Locks	251
Secondary Flight Controls	251
Wing Flaps	251
Lift-dumpers	252
Speed Brakes	252
Supplementary Flight Controls	252
Trims	252
Autopilot	253
Flight Data Recorder/Cockpit Voice Recorder	253
Data Recovery	254
Fire Damage Analysis	254
Fire Survivability	255
Location of Recorders	256
Solid-State Recorders	256
Flight Path Reconstruction	257
Aircraft Weight	257
Airworthiness of C-FONF	258
Applicable Legislation and Regulations Effective March 10, 1989	258
Certification	259
Certification Requirements	259
Canadian Certification History of C-FONF	260
Letter of Approval	261

Minimum Equipment List	262
Maintenance History	263
Airframe	263
Engines	264
Deferred Unserviceabilities	265
Reportable Incidents	268
State of Serviceability of C-FONF on March 10, 1989	269
Validity of Certificate of Airworthiness of C-FONF while Operated by Air Ontario	270
Letter of Approval	270
Maintenance Control Manual	270
Minimum Equipment List	270
Findings	271
Aircraft Wreckage Investigation	271
Airworthiness of C-FONF	272
Recommendations	272
Aircraft Crash Charts	272
Survivability of Flight Data Recorders and Cockpit Voice Recorders in Aircraft Crashes	273
Letter of Approval Requirement	274
Definition of "Essential Equipment"	274
<b>11 Aircraft Crash Survivability</b>	<b>275</b>
Passengers' Recollections	275
Survival Factors	281
Cabin Safety	281
Passenger Behaviour and Evacuation	282
Seat Belts	286
Seats	286
Interior Lighting	287
Survivor Survey	288
Crash Survival and Impact Survival	290
Aircraft Fire	293
Introduction	293
Fire Propagation	294
Dynamic Phase	294
Static Phase	295
Combustibility of Materials	297
Findings	299
Recommendation	300

**12 Fokker F-28, Mk1000, Aircraft Performance and Flight Dynamics 301**

Background 304

Manufacturer's Performance Research and Testing 306

Water/Slush Ingestion by Engines on Takeoff 307

Wing Leading-Edge Damage 311

Denting 311

Condition of the Paint 313

Unexpected Stalling Due to Wing Anti-Ice Air Leakage 314

Relevant F-28 Wing Surface Contamination Occurrences 315

Hanover, Germany, February 25, 1969 315

Izmir, Turkey, January 26, 1974 317

Wing Contamination – Research 318

Flight Dynamics of the Fokker F-28 Mk1000 325

Fokker Flight Simulation Report 326

Flight Dynamics Report 332

Aerodynamics 335

Dynamic Simulations 336

Dynamic Simulations: Modelling and Flying Techniques 337

Runway Contamination 337

Wing Contamination 337

Engine Failure on Takeoff 339

Summary of Simulation Experience 339

Non-Standard Handling Techniques 340

Mathematical Modelling and Modelling Validation 342

Model-Run Matrix 343

Presentation of Results 343

Validation 345

Discussions and Conclusions 345

Particular Effects of Aircraft Contamination 347

Propeller-Driven Aircraft 347

Wing with Leading-Edge Devices versus Hard Wing 351

Freezing Precipitation on Aircraft Surfaces 354

Witness Descriptions of Wing Contamination 354

National Research Council Report: "Freezing Precipitation on Lifting Surfaces" 355

Quantity of Precipitation Accumulated 356

Freezing of Accumulated Precipitation 357

Adiabatic and Evaporative Cooling 357

Conduction of Heat into the Fuel Tanks 357

Discussion and Summary 359

Findings 359

Takeoff from Wet or Contaminated Runways 360



Information and Procedures Available for Safe Operation in Cold  
Weather Conditions 372  
    The Phenomenon of "Cold Soaking" 376  
Assessing the Condition of the Outside of the Aircraft 378  
Findings 380  
Recommendations 383

## VOLUME II

### PART FIVE *THE AIR CARRIER – AIR ONTARIO INC.*

13 Corporate History 389  
14 Management Organization 408  
15 The F-28 Program: Planning 436  
16 The F-28 Program: The Auxiliary Power Unit, the Minimum  
    Equipment List, and the Dilemma Facing the Crew of Flight  
    1363 459  
17 The F-28 Program: Lack of Ground-Start Facilities at Dryden 529  
18 The F-28 Program: Spare Parts 534  
19 The F-28 Program: Flight Operations Manuals 553  
20 The F-28 Program: Flight Operations Training 588  
21 The F-28 Program: Operational Practices – Hot Refuelling and  
    Aircraft Ground De-icing 640  
22 The F-28 Program: Flight Attendant Shoulder Harness 665  
23 Operational Control 687  
24 Flight Safety 744  
25 Management Performance 790  
26 The Role of Air Canada: Parent/Subsidiary Implications 818

## VOLUME III

### PART SIX *TRANSPORT CANADA*

- 27 *Organization* 857
- 28 *Conditions at Transport Canada in the Early 1980s* 867
- 29 *Economic Deregulation and Deficit Reduction* 870
- 30 *The Effects of Deregulation and Downsizing on Aviation Safety* 881
- 31 *Aviation Regulation: Resourcing Process* 916
- 32 *Audit Program* 944
- 33 *Audit of Air Ontario Inc., 1988* 953
- 34 *Operating Rules and Legislation* 1000
- 35 *Company Check Pilot* 1015
- 36 *Contracting Out, Waivers, and Spot Checks* 1023
- 37 *Safety Management and the Transport Canada Organization* 1030

### PART SEVEN *HUMAN FACTORS*

- 38 *Crew Information* 1055
- 39 *Crew Coordination and the Communication of Safety Concerns by Passengers* 1071
- 40 *Human Performance: A System Analysis* 1096

### PART EIGHT *LEGAL AND OTHER ISSUES BEFORE THE COMMISSION*

- 41 *The Aviation Accident Investigation Process in Canada* 1143

- 42 Aviation Incident and Occurrence Reporting and the Issue of Pilot Confidentiality 1165
- 43 Objection to Production of Documents, Based on a Confidence of the Queen's Privy Council, Section 39, Canada Evidence Act, R.S.C. 1985, c.C-5 1187
- 44 Inquiries Act, R.S.C. 1985, c.I-11, Section 13 1192

## PART NINE CONSOLIDATED RECOMMENDATIONS

- Interim Report, 1989* 1203
- Second Interim Report, 1990* 1204
- Final Report* 1208

## GENERAL APPENDICES

- A Order in Council 1247
- B Counsel and Representatives for Parties with Standing 1250
- C Parties Granted Full, Limited, and Special Participant Status and Observer Status 1253
- D Witnesses Appearing before the Inquiry 1254
- E Inquiry Schedule 1275
- F Letter from the Chief Coroner for Ontario, July 15, 1991 1277
- G Time Sequence of Events Surrounding the Crash 1280
- H Summary of Fatalities and Survivor Injuries 1294
- I Minutes of Debriefing Meetings, Town of Dryden, March 13 and 16, 1989 1301
- J U.S. Department of Transportation, Federal Aviation Administration, Advisory Circular 120-51, Cockpit Resource Management Training, Dated December 1, 1989 1319
- K Transport Canada Response to the Interim Recommendations of the Second Interim Report, Dryden Commission of Inquiry 1327
- L Letter of Notice Sent by Commission Counsel to Affected Parties, re: Inquiries Act, R.S.C. 1985, c.I-11, Section 13 1334
- M Rulings 1337