

U.S. Department of Education

Washington, D.C. 20202-5335



APPLICATION FOR GRANTS UNDER THE

NATIVE AMERICAN AND ALASKA NATIVE CHILDREN IN SCHOOL PROGRAM
CFDA # 84.365C
PR/Award # T365C110013

Closing Date: MAR 21, 2011

ABSTRACT

The Mescalero Apache School (MAS) is located on the Mescalero Apache Reservation in south-central New Mexico. It is funded by the Bureau of Indian Education (BIE) and operated by the Mescalero Apache Tribe. The Mescalero Apache School requests \$947,561 over five years for its Mescalero Apache School Language Proficiency Project.

Our project has three fundamental goals. We seek to: (1) increase the English language proficiency of MAS students, (2) increase the Apache language proficiency of MAS students, and (3) increase the preparedness of MAS students for post-secondary education and training. We establish our need to accomplish these goals primarily by presenting our students' scores on standard tests given in the State of New Mexico. Our students' scores are significantly lower than the scores of other New Mexican students. Our students' scores are also lower than most other American Indian students in the state.

We designed our project based on the premise that MAS students' English and Apache language competencies are intimately related and mutually supportive. We will improve English language competency, including phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary, and comprehension, by enhancing those same features in Apache. Conversely, we will improve Apache language competency by improving English language skills. In this regard, we believe that bilingualism is extraordinarily beneficial for students, as research confirms.

Our proposed strategy has nine interrelated components. We will: (1) hire an additional Apache Language Teacher to improve our student/teacher ratio; (2) hire an Apache Language Resource Specialist to assist in all program activities; (3) incorporate additional reading, writing, and grammar in Apache language instruction; (4) develop additional Apache language educational materials; (5) provide additional education and training for Apache Language Program personnel, developing our human resources; (6) increase parent and guardian participation at MAS; (7) enhance cooperation, communication, and coordination of effort between the Apache Language Program, the MAS Reading Program, and other programs and departments in the MAS Professional Learning Community; (8) objectively and regularly evaluate our program focusing not only on our students' proficiencies, but also on the effectiveness of project implementation and on progress toward achieving project outcomes; and (9) incorporate data-based decision-making.

The Mescalero Apache Reservation includes roughly 720 square miles in Otero County in south-central New Mexico. The Tribe has approximately 5,400 members, about one-half of whom are under the age of eighteen. Most tribal members live on the reservation. The reservation is rural with approximately 1,200 residents living in the town of Mescalero and approximately 3,000 in the 88340 zip code area. Accurate demographic data are hard to obtain for the tribe, but characteristics of the residents of Mescalero Reservation zip code area are available and provide a reasonable sense of socioeconomic conditions. Estimated median household income in 2007 was \$28,803 compared to \$41,452 for the state of New Mexico. Approximately 36% of persons lived below the poverty level and 18.2% lived below 50% of the poverty level. According to the tribal census, per-capita annual income on the reservation is \$4,603 (compared to \$14,305 for Otero County). 92% of children live in households that are below the poverty level and 27% of children are classified as abused or in need of intervention. Extended families often live together in households that are miles from neighbors. Mescalero is isolated socially, geographically, and economically, which contributes to high unemployment, high poverty levels, and low educational proficiencies. One hundred percent (100%) of Mescalero children qualify for the USDA school lunch program.

Approximately 500 students attend the MAS and Native American students comprise 100% of the MAS student body.

ENROLLMENT AT THE MESCALERO APACHE SCHOOLS, 2010-2011												
K	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th	5 th	6 th	7 th	8 th	9 th	10 th	11 th	12 th
71	34	47	41	36	36	44	40	47	79	40	49	26

We establish our need for funding from the Department of Education (DOE) to improve the English and Apache language proficiencies of our students primarily on the extremely low scores of our students on the state-wide New Mexico Standards Based Assessment (NMSBA). The following table documents the low scores:

MESCALERO APACHE SCHOOLS, NMSBA RESULTS TOTAL SCHOOL PERCENTAGES: READING (2009-10)								
Grade	Tested #	Valid Scores #	Beginning Step %	Nearing Proficiency %	Proficient %	Advanced %	No Score %	Proficient or Above %
3 rd	38	37	58%	26%	13%	0%	3%	13%
4 th	49	49	29%	55%	16%	0%	0%	16%
5 th	36	36	22%	67%	8%	3%	0%	11%
6 th	22	22	45%	55%	0%	0%	0%	0%
7 th	28	27	29%	46%	21%	0%	4%	21%
8 th	20	20	10%	65%	25%	0%	0%	25%
11 th	26	26	31%	46%	19%	4%	0%	23%

The BIE funds 184 elementary/secondary schools. It serves 50,000 students, 63 reservations, 238 tribes, and 23 states. Among all these schools, the BIE has classified MAS as one of 19 "Prioritized-Target Tier III Schools" performing in the bottom quintile (20%) of all BIE schools based on combined proficiencies in reading and mathematics. We include here the BIE Report Card for MAS.

MESCALERO APACHE SCHOOLS STUDENT ACHIEVEMENT: READING						
	Number Students	Participation Rate %	Basic %	Proficient %	Advanced %	Proficient + Advanced %
All Students	221	99.55	84.5	14.55	0.91	15.45
Males	112	99.11	86.49	12.61	0.90	13.51
Females	109	100	82.57	16.51	0.92	17.43
IEP	40	100	100	0.00	0.00	0.00
LEP	206	99.51	85.85	14.15	0.91	15.45

MAS 2009-2010 results on the World-Class Instructional Design and Assessment's (WIDA) Assessing Comprehension and Communication in English State-to-State for English Language Learners (ACCESS For ELLs) are as follows:

MESCALERO APACHE SCHOOL RESULTS: 2009-2010
ACCESS FOR ELLS ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY TEST

Grade	Number	Entering	Beginning	Developing	Expanding	Bridging	Reaching
K	53	19	7	14	8	4	1
1 st	36	0	6	20	10	0	0
2 nd	42	0	2	23	16	0	0
3 rd	37	1	2	18	12	4	0
4 th	30	1	1	10	17	1	0
5 th	19	1	2	5	11	0	0
6 th	0	5	11	0	0	0	0
7 th	2	8	6	1	0	0	0
8 th	9	1	2	6	0	0	0
9 th	37	0	5	26	6	0	0
10 th	21	0	8	12	1	0	0
11 th	10	1	1	6	2	0	0
12 th	6	0	2	4	0	0	0

The Apache language proficiency of MAS students is also surprisingly low. Many of our students are learning relatively little Apache language at home, yet are not becoming proficient in English either. Our mission in the MAS Apache Language Program has been to improve the oral Apache language proficiency of our students. Now, we will focus on their Apache reading, writing, and grammar, as well. We will use Apache language literacy as a means for preserving the Apache language in our Tribe and as a means for improving our students' English language proficiency, as described in the proposal.

Finally, MAS students have low high school graduation rates and low participation in post-secondary education. Approximately 20 of our students graduate each year and approximately 8 of those eventually go to college or obtain training in other programs. We seek to increase the preparedness of our students to participate in post-secondary education and to increase the number who do so.

We will measure English proficiency using the above standard tests given by the State of New Mexico. We will measure Apache language proficiency using the Apache Language Skills Assessment developed at MAS. We will track MAS student enrollment in post-secondary education and training using MAS tracking software. We will observe classroom instruction and interview stakeholders. We will schedule regular in-service meetings to analyze our data and make data-based decisions.

A. PROJECT DESIGN (30 POINTS)

Measurable Goals, Objectives, and Outcomes (20 Points). We designed the Mescalero Apache School Language Proficiency Project to accomplish three fundamental goals.

Goal 1: Increase the English Language Proficiency of MAS students. Ultimately, we will measure our success in achieving this goal by monitoring the performance of our students on standard tests given in the State of New Mexico. We seek improved English language proficiency test scores for our students.

Goal 2: Increase the Apache Language Proficiency of MAS students. We will measure our success in achieving this goal by monitoring the performance of our students on tests given in the MAS Apache Language Program. We seek improved Apache language proficiency test scores for our students.

Goal 3: Increase the Preparedness of MAS Students for Post-secondary Education and Training. We seek increased enrollment in post-secondary education and training for MAS students.

The remainder of this proposal describes the manner in which we will pursue these goals. We define nine strategic objectives and outcomes, each of which we will measure in an objective and quantifiable manner. We have qualified personnel to accomplish project objectives. We have a well-specified project management plan. And, we have a detailed evaluation plan with which we will assess the project, including the performance and preparedness of our students.

Project Strategy, Objectives, and Outcomes. We designed our project based on the premise that our students' English and Apache language competencies are intimately related and mutually supportive. We will improve English language competency, including phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary, and comprehension, by enhancing those same features

in Apache. Conversely, we will improve Apache language competency by improving English language skills. In this regard, we believe that bilingualism is extraordinarily beneficial for students, as research confirms.

When designing this project, we identified nine specific needs that we must address (or obstacles that we must overcome) to meet our primary goals. Each of those needs defined a specific project objective. We then constructed a concrete strategy for achieving each specific project objective. Finally, we determined objective ways of measuring our outcomes in each strategic area. If we properly implement our nine-part strategy and meet our objectives in each area, we will achieve our primary goals. The English language and Apache language proficiencies of our students will improve. As these improve, so too will the preparedness of our students for post-secondary education and training.

At MAS, the Apache Language Program currently offers Apache language and culture instruction to all students K-12. The Apache Language Program offers 30 minutes per day of Apache language instruction in grades K-5 and 50 minutes per day in middle school and high school. The primary mission of the Apache Language Program has been to increase the oral competency of our students. This mission was based on the Tribe's view that Apache is first and foremost an oral language. The MAS Apache Language Program has a Program Director, Lola Ahidley, and five full-time Apache language teachers: Ruby Chino, Birdina Evans, Lenore Vasile, Houston Murphy, and Rena J. Mendez. Our present curriculum is focused on family and kinship, the environment and seasons, the traditional socioeconomic cycle (including traditional hunting, plant gathering, and agriculture), Apache lifestyles (including traditional clothing, foods, and ceremonies), and traditional Apache health and wellness (including traditional plants and medicines). Our mission is now evolving. The Tribal Administration, the School Board, the

MAS Superintendent, staff in the Apache Language Program, and the majority of community members now want to incorporate additional Apache language reading, writing, and grammar into our curriculum. This change in mission requires that we overcome several obstacles to successfully reach our ultimate goals.

Strategic Objective and Activity 1: Hire an Additional Apache Language Teacher.

Apache Language Program personnel work extraordinarily hard to meet the program's current mission. Each of our Apache language classes has approximately 30 students and the largest have 35 students. We have no teachers' assistants and we have no substitute teachers who speak Apache. We have, nevertheless, been quite successful at developing the oral Apache language competency of our students. It will, however, be more difficult effectively and efficiently to accomplish an expanded Apache language mission that incorporates reading, writing, and grammar. We will need, for example, smaller classes and more time to develop our literacy curriculum and to incorporate new instructional techniques and materials. An additional Apache Language Teacher (ALT) will make this possible. This person will instruct our LEP students and aid the Program Director in all areas of the project. The ALT's responsibilities include: (1) classroom planning, organization, implementation, and teaching; (2) preparation of Apache language curriculum and instruction materials; (3) preparation of lesson plans; (4) participation in extra-classroom activities; (5) participation in assessment activities; (6) participation in stakeholder meetings; (7) participation in professional development activities; and (8) on-site visits to universities, reservations, and schools to learn about other Native language programs. We will accomplish this objective by hiring an additional Apache Language Teacher, providing him/her with necessary training, and using him/her in classroom instruction.

Strategic Objective and Activity 2: Hire an Apache Language Resource Specialist.

We presently have no program support person who can help develop the curriculum and educational materials we need to teach Apache language literacy. We must hire an Apache Language Resource Specialist (ALRS) to accomplish these tasks. ALRS responsibilities will include: (1) aiding Apache Language Teachers in every aspect of their job; (2) researching, compiling, adapting, and creating useful language materials; (3) integrating best practices into all program materials and activities, (4) substitute teaching for ALTs; (5) helping coordinate language activities, parent/guardian involvement in classroom activities, ALT workshops, and ALT travel; (6) participating in professional development activities; (7) visiting universities, reservations, and schools to learn about other Native language programs; and (8) handling all electronic features of our project (including audio recording, video recording, audio editing, video editing, management of electronic files, creation of CDs, creation of DVDs, and printing Apache language texts). We will accomplish this objective by hiring a qualified person.

Strategic Objective and Activity 3: Incorporate Additional Reading, Writing, and Grammar in Apache Language Instruction. The Apache Language Program's expanded mission is to focus on Apache language literacy. As we do so, the Apache Language Program will follow guidelines and practices required by the Bureau of Indian Education (BIE) for its reading programs. BIE Reads! Program Guidelines, which have been implemented by the MAS English Reading Program, are as follows: (1) high expectations for reading achievement; (2) sufficient instructional time; (3) careful lesson planning; (4) a school-wide assessment system; (5) school-wide interventions for struggling students; (6) sound instructional approaches; (7) a climate of collaboration, strong leadership, and evidence of commitment; and (8) high-quality professional development. The BIE requires that reading classrooms in its schools have these

characteristics: (1) reading programs that include instructional content based on the five critical components; (2) coherent instructional design that includes explicit instructional strategies based on the five components, curriculum standards, coordinated instructional sequences, ample practice opportunities, and aligned student materials; (3) ongoing use of assessments that inform instructional decisions; (4) a protected, dedicated block of time for reading instruction; (5) clear expectations for student achievement and clear strategies for monitoring progress; (6) small-group instruction to meet individual student needs, with placement and movement based on ongoing assessments; (7) active student engagement in a variety of reading related activities which are connected to academic goals; and (9) instruction designed to bring all children to grade level, with appropriate scientifically-based intervention strategies aligned with classroom instruction for students not making sufficient progress. Because MAS is a BIE school, we will build our Apache language literacy program using these guidelines. The School Board, Superintendent, MAS staff, MAS Reading Program staff, the English Language Evaluator, the Apache Language Evaluator, and interested parents and guardians will use also these guidelines to assess program organization and progress (see "Project Management Plan" and "Project Evaluation Plan").

We will develop our Apache language literacy curriculum with significant input from all the above stakeholders and the Indigenous Language Consultants. As noted, we will develop our curriculum to incorporate the fundamental components of literacy skills: (a) phonemic awareness, (b) phonics, (b) fluency, (d) vocabulary, and (e) comprehension. We intend, also, to: (1) use all components of the curriculum as we have designed them, (2) use the appropriate materials with each grouping of students, (3) annually evaluate the Apache language fluency and literacy of MAS students using our Apache Language Skills Assessment (ALSA) (see below),

and (4) annually evaluate the English language proficiency of our students using the NMSBA and ACCESS test for ELLs (see below).

Phonemic Awareness, Phonics, and Fluency. We will design all our activities by grade or level to sharpen students' ability to: (1) discriminate and produce Apache sounds, (2) identify and understand the Apache alphabet, and (3) fluently combine Apache sounds and symbols.

Vocabulary. We will introduce students to social language vocabulary by learning words for everyday items and situations from Apache culture. These vocabulary items include words from greetings, kinship, food items, common objects, weather, expressions for time, and many everyday situations. While we teach Apache social vocabulary, we will also review and enhance students' understanding of English. For example, when we explain the meanings of ăitú (it is red), ăiga (it is white), dităish (it is green/blue), and ăizhî (it is black), we will reinforce students' English language proficiency. Students will, for instance, learn how Apache words differ conceptually from English words. From the above list, for example, students will learn that dităish (it is green/blue) has a meaning that includes separate colors labeled by the English words (blue) and (green). When students translate from Apache to English and from English to Apache, their vocabularies in both languages are improved.

Academic language vocabulary is less developed in Apache than social language vocabulary, as is true for many indigenous languages. However, we emphasize that any concept that may be expressed in English may also be expressed in Apache. Presently, we are translating the Northwest Evaluation Association (NEWA) assessment vocabulary from English to Apache. Many of the vocabulary items have corresponding terms in Apache. Others, however, must be translated using Apache phrases. Regardless, using such vocabulary in our Apache language

classes will provide students with additional exposure to concepts that are crucial to their academic success.

Comprehension. We will enhance our students' comprehension in both Apache and English through extensive Apache reading, bilingual exercises, and grammar instruction. The above Apache language vocabulary items provide one small example. When explaining the meanings of *ãitú* (it is red), *ãiga* (it is white), *ditãish* (it is green/blue), and *ãizhî* (it is black), we will discuss the linguistic concepts of adjectives and verbs. In English, red, white, blue, green, and black are adjectives. They belong to a particular part of speech and have a particular syntactic function. In Apache, those words are verbs, not adjectives. When analyzing such examples, we are able to enhance the linguistic competencies of students in both English and Apache. We will measure Apache language competencies using the Apache Language Skills Assessment (ALSA) that we discuss below. We will measure English language competencies using standardized tests administered in New Mexico. We anticipate that students' scores on these tests will improve through the funding period.

Strategic Objective and Activity 4: Develop Additional Apache language Educational Materials. We will incorporate into the Apache Language Program many instruction materials that focus on phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary, and comprehension at appropriate levels. Meeting this objective requires that we develop more Apache language educational materials for an expanded Apache language literacy curriculum. Apache language has, until the last few years, been an exclusively oral language. We now have an introductory Apache dictionary, a grammar, and various texts, but we need to produce much more. To do so, our ALTs will work during summer months. They will participate each summer in a two week workshop on curriculum and instruction. Our Indigenous Language Consultants

will participate in the workshop for one week, teaching ALTs new strategies and instruction techniques. During week two of the workshop, ALTs will work extensively on materials for the following school year. Also, given the paucity of Apache language materials available to our students, ALTs will work with Apache Language Consultants to record traditional stories, historical narratives, and other relevant educational materials.

We will use a multidisciplinary approach to the creation of teaching materials that combines methods and insights from traditional Apache Culture and from Western Education. Producing additional Apache literacy materials will require several interrelated activities. (1) We will create Apache written and sound archives (documentary records) preserving in different formats as much Apache language material as possible. Future generations of Apache people are going to need sound and written archives as well as dictionaries, textbooks, other books. (2) We will use such documentary records to create teaching materials that will help preserve and revitalize the Apache language and promote literacy and language skills among MAS students. Significantly, we will use modern technology to create documentary records and teaching materials. Utilizing current technology will allow us to produce more valuable documentary records and more effective teaching tools. For example, students must hear the words spoken by proficient Apache speakers engaged in active discourse to become comfortable with the language. Grammars, dictionaries, and readers (some, perhaps, being multimedia "talking books") as well as music on audio cassettes or CDs are all valuable tools for learning. Students also need a record of the histories and other stories passed down by earlier speakers of the language so they can hear the discourse of their parents and grandparents. ALTs, the Apache Language Evaluator, staff from the Mescalero Apache Tribe Language Program, and Apache Language Consultants will work together on this portion of the project.

We offer the following example of the kinds of materials that we will produce in support of our project goals and objectives. We modified this (high school level) text for inclusion in this application. Space prohibits inclusion of other examples. We note, however, that constructing and teaching with this text requires all relevant features of BIE reading program requirements.

Apache Children at the Carlisle Indian School, 1886

Apache children arriving at the Carlisle Indian Industrial School, November 1886.



Chiricahua Apache Children after four months at the Carlisle Indian Industrial School, February 1887. Seven of these children died of diseases they contracted at Carlisle.



'Adí Ch'uk'ánéõde bizhaaõde 'ádaat'í.	These are Chiricahua Apache children.
1886-dá, kedaa'iiyá.	In 1886, they were photographed.
Saãdáagu 'eächíõde guch'áyínjaa.	(U. S) soldiers separated the children from their parents.
Saãdáagu 'eächíõde Karlail-yá kaayúndíã	The (U. S.) soldiers threw the children into Carlisle (Indian Industrial School).
Gumáõde shí guta'õde biã Florida-yá niináneã'â-yá ánjiiyé.	Their mothers and fathers were in imprisoned in Florida at the edge of the continent.
'Eächíõde nédaaãdzí shí biãdaagútûyé-ná'.	The children were afraid and they were sad
Dáshígundá dáanzî-ná'.	They were thinking about what would happen to them.
'Indá'í gúniiõât'é-ná'.	They were not sure of life. (They were not sure that they would live.)
Biãtségu, dábííni háshdiká-ná'.	Before, they traveled freely. (Before, they were free.)
K'adi Karlail-yá 'ánjiiyé.	Now, they were imprisoned at Carlisle (Indian Industrial School).
'Indaa, gúúzhîní k'e'át'é-gu, ãã.	White people, like ants, were numerous.

'Eāchíōde bit'ekéōde duu nádaayiiātsé-da dáanzì.	The children think that they will not see their parents again.
'Eāchíōde ch'íōdá daabiyeesxí.	Loneliness is killing the children.
'Indaaōde 'eāchíōde bitsiigha'í yaadaayúshé.	White people shaved the children's hair.
'Eāchíōde 'eā'eāt'é-gu 'é yeebúndíā.	The children were dressed uniformly (by the white people).
'Indaa bik'eyágu 'é yeegúdíā.	They (the children) were dressed in the manner of white people.
Ch'uubayéōde 'ít'a nédaaādzí-shi biādaagútúyúé nák'e'ádaat'é.	The poor little ones (after they were dressed like white people) still appear to be scared and sad.
Āānī Karlail-yā 'iāēdaaska.	Many (children) at Carlisle were placed in the earth. (Many children at Carlisle died.)
'Isdáhukaōde bit'ekéōde yaanáká.	Those (children) who survived returned to their families.

We will accomplish this objective by producing each year: (1) 200 hours of Apache language recordings, (2) 5 hours of finished educational video for classroom and home use, (3) 5 hours of finished audio recordings for classroom and home use, (4) 100 pages of Apache language reading materials (texts), and (5) 10 sets of Apache language lesson plans organized around the sorts of topics identified above.

Strategic Objective and Activity 5: Obtain additional Education and Training for Apache Language Program Personnel (Professional Development). Our Apache Language Teachers require professional development, especially as we move toward increased inclusion of reading, writing, and grammar into the Apache language curriculum. As noted, the Apache Language Program has emphasized oral language and conversational fluency. Now that we intend to strengthen Apache language literacy, our teachers will require additional training and professional development.

Our plan for professional development has several features. ALTs will: (1) attend the American Indian Language Development Institute at the University of Arizona, (2) attend the University of New Mexico's Summer Institute of Linguistics for Native Americans, (3) participate in summer curriculum and instruction workshops with Indigenous Language Consultants; (4) participate in trainings, workshops, and monthly work sessions with MAS Reading Program personnel; (5) participate in weekly Apache linguistics classes that focus on grammatical analysis; (6) work with external consultants/evaluators to learn more about program assessment; (7) attend the annual National Indian Education Association Conference; and (8) attend the annual National Association for Bilingual Education Conference.

The American Indian Language Development Institute is nationally recognized and has operated for almost thirty years. It offers courses in, for example, teaching Native languages, grant writing, computer technology, and linguistics. UNM's Summer Institute of Linguistics focuses on linguistics, curriculum development, and immersion techniques for use in teaching Native American languages. The MAS has recently initiated a "Collaboration Period" during each school day to promote communication and cooperation among members of the MAS Professional Learning Community. We will schedule our collaborations with the MAS Reading Program during this period. We previously described the proposed summer workshops on curriculum and instruction. Dr. Scott Rushforth, professor of Anthropology and Linguistics at New Mexico State University (NMSU), will teach twice-weekly Apache language linguistics classes at MAS throughout the funding period.

We will evaluate this objective by monitoring participation in the identified activities.

Strategic Objective and Activity 6: Increase Parent and Guardian Involvement at MAS. The Apache Language Program has had relatively little parent and guardian participation

in educational activities. We must significantly increase their participation to improve our students' language proficiencies. We discuss our plan to address this need in the section titled "Parental Involvement." We will measure this objective by recording the number of activities we have and the number of stakeholders who participate. We will also conduct an outcomes assessment at the end of each activity.

Strategic Objective and Activity 7: Enhance Cooperation, Communication, and Coordination of Effort between the Apache Language Program, the MAS Reading Program, and other Programs and Departments in the MAS Professional Learning Community. Until recently, there has been relatively little cooperation and collaboration between the Apache Language Program and other programs at MAS. Previous MAS administrators viewed Apache language and culture as incidental and superfluous to students' academic studies. Some actually viewed Apache language and culture to be detrimental to student success. Accordingly, they placed the Apache Language Program apart from "academic" programs. Administrators and educators at MAS and throughout the nation now know that such segregation is misguided. Administrators and educators throughout Indian Country are looking to Native language and culture studies not only as inherently valuable, but as a means to improve the academic success of our children. According to the National Indian Education Association, greater Native American control over the education of Native American students will lead to better results and healthier Native American communities and the use of Native American languages as a medium of instruction will increase overall Native American student achievement" (Wilde 2010).

To increase collaboration between the Apache Language Program and other MAS programs, we will schedule monthly, joint collaborative work sessions for all relevant personnel.

Also, ALTs will be included in all professional development activities available to MAS Reading Program personnel. This has not been true in the past.

We will measure this objective by monitoring participation in monthly collaborative work sessions and other professional development activities.

Strategic Objective and Activity 8: Conduct Regular and Effective Evaluation. We will incorporate objective measurements of: (1) English and Apache language proficiency, (2) student participation in post-secondary education and training, and (3) the effectiveness of project implementation strategies. We will also regularly (4) evaluate our progress toward project goals. We discuss assessment below (see "Project Evaluation").

Strategic Objective and Activity 9: Data-Based Decision Making. MAS and the Mescalero Apache Tribe Department of Education have existing informational infrastructure to manage all data we will collect during evaluation activities. We will: (1) enter into the existing MAS performance and tracking database all pertinent information, (2) compile English and Apache language test scores, and (3) analyze performance data to demonstrate student proficiencies, project effectiveness, and progress toward project goals. We will incorporate performance feedback into project design and implementation. The evaluation team will: (1) analyze and compare this data to proposed outcomes; (2) provide feedback to improve instructional practices, policies, and student outcomes; and (3) assist project staff in implementing any recommendations (see "Project Evaluation").

We will use the existing Mescalero Apache Tribe Department of Education database to track MAS student post-secondary education and training. Importantly, the Tribe's Department of Education also tracks Tribal students who graduate from Tularosa High School and Ruidoso

High School, neither of which has an Apache language program. Such data will provide us with the means to compare Apache students with different experiences in Apache language literacy.

Building Capacity and Sustainability (5 points). Our sustainability plan requires answers to three questions: (1) "How will we develop human resources needed to sustain continued ELL improvement?" (2) "How will we obtain the required Apache language materials to sustain a literacy program beyond DOE funding." And, (3) "Where will we obtain necessary fiscal resources for continued project success after DOE funds are expended?"

Professionally developing ALTs capable of instructing Apache language reading, writing, and grammar is essential. All ALT staff members are committed to developing their professional capacity through trainings and workshops provided as part of this project. This commitment ensures LEP student have a greater chance of mastering English and Apache and continuing their academic careers beyond high school. All ALT are native speakers of Apache. All are licensed by the State of New Mexico Department of Education Professional Licensure Bureau. During this project, all Apache Language Teachers will: (1) take courses in language preservation and teaching at the University of New Mexico (UNM) and the University of Arizona (UA); (2) participate in summer curriculum and instruction workshops with Indigenous Language Consultants; (3) participate in trainings, workshops, and monthly collaborative sessions with MAS Reading Program personnel; (4) participate in weekly Apache linguistics classes that focus on grammatical analysis; and (5) work with external evaluators to learn more about program assessment. We will build the future of this project, in part, on their expertise. We will commit time, effort, and money over the funding period to develop the human resources necessary to insure sustained project success.

Our second sustainability and success carryover question pertains to Apache language curriculum and instruction. Over five years of DOE funding we will develop and incorporate our Apache language literacy curriculum and the instructional resources necessary to insure sustained program success. Everything we develop in these areas, all our new instructional materials, will be available for future use. Related to this, we intend to record 200 hours of interviews with Apache Language Consultants (Elders) each year during funding. These recordings will provide a priceless archive of traditional Apache language materials that we can "mine" for years to come as we continue to develop Apache language literacy materials.

Our final sustainability and success carryover question concerns fiscal resources, about which we make two points. (A) The Mescalero Apache Tribe and Bureau of Indian Education are committed to maintaining the Apache Language Program after DOE funding is exhausted. It is more important than ever that Apache students develop ELP and continue their education beyond high school. This is one way to ensure the economic and social lives of our children. For this reason, MAS is committed to sustaining the Apache Language Reading Program, including its expanded literacy focus. MAS also is committed to maintaining a more communicative, cooperative, and collaborative Professional Learning Community. In particular, MAS is committed to maintaining an integrative approach to English and Apache language instruction.

(B) We will seek funds to maintain the requested Apache Language Teacher and Apache Language Resource Specialist. The Tribal Council, School Board, and MAS Superintendent recently reaffirmed their strong commitments to Apache language instruction. They requested the expanded literacy program and dedicated themselves to obtaining the resources necessary for an efficient and effective program.

Parental Involvement (5 points). Our strategy to increase the involvement of parents, guardians, and other community members at MAS has three components. First, we intend to schedule an Apache Literacy Open House each month during the school year. At the Open Houses we will organize several activities that highlight Apache literacy and the achievements of our students. Second, we intend to invite parents and guardians to participate in Apache language classes at MAS. Parents and guardians will come to MAS during a normal day, observe, learn, and participate in their children's education. Third, we will send home with students Apache language educational materials, homework, and literacy-based activities that will not only engage our students, but also their parents and guardians. Such materials will include texts, audio CDs, video DVDs, and interactive lessons.

B. PROJECT PERSONNEL (10 POINTS)

Non-Traditional Staff (Project Staff who are Members of Under-Represented Categories) (2 points). The MAS Superintendent, Apache Language Program Director, and all ALTs are enrolled members of the Mescalero Apache Tribe of New Mexico. All Indigenous Language Consultants (who will work at Mescalero for one week each summer) will be enrolled members of different American Indian Tribes.

Qualifications of Project Director (4 points). Our Project Director is Ms. Lola Ahidley (M.E.). Ms. Ahidley has a Masters Degree in Education from the University of Arizona (UA) and an additional 18 hours of UA graduate level linguistics courses. Ms. Ahidley has directed the MAS Apache Language Program for over 10 years. Her duties as Director are: (1) supervising day-to-day operations, (2) planning and implementing staff (and parent) professional development, (3) developing curriculum and educational materials, (4) recommending resource allocations, (4) evaluating staff and students, (5) organizing extra-curricular language and culture

activities, and (6) articulating with other MAS programs. These are the same duties she will have as Project Director. Ms. Ahidley is a native speaker of Apache and an enrolled member of the Mescalero Apache Tribe.

Qualifications of Key Project Personnel (4 points). Our present Apache Language Teachers are Ruby Chino, Birdina Evans, Lenore Vasile, Houston Murphy, and Rena J. Mendez. All ALTs are native Apache speakers and enrolled members of the Mescalero Apache Tribe. All are licensed by the State of New Mexico Department of Education Professional Licensure Bureau and all have attended multiple seminars, trainings, and workshops concerning Native American language curriculum and instruction. All ALTs have attended one year of New Mexico State University (NMSU) Apache Linguistics courses taught by Dr. Scott Rushforth, Professor of Anthropology and Linguistics. And, all ALTs are committed to the proposed project, including pursuit of additional professional development during the funding period.

Sharon Gatti-Carson, Ph.D. presently evaluates reading and math programs at MAS. She will act as our English Language Consultant and Evaluator. Dr. Gatti-Carson has a Ph.D. in teacher education and staff development. She has been an educator for 41 years and was a university assistant professor for 13 years. She has been an educational consultant for 35+ years in multiple states and countries. She currently consults in Reading First with the Colorado Department of Education and on reading and math for the Bureau of Indian Education at multiple sites (including sites in Maine, North Dakota, Wisconsin, Washington, Arizona, Idaho, South Dakota, and New Mexico). She also consults with the New Mexico Public Education Department on reading and math.

Dr. Scott Rushforth will act as our Apache Language Consultant and Evaluator. He has 25+ years teaching experience in anthropology and linguistics at the University of New Mexico

and NMSU. He is author of several books and multiple papers on Native American languages, including Mescalero and Chiricahua Apache. He is co-author of two Mescalero Apache dictionaries. Dr. Rushforth has been intimately involved with university outcomes assessment. He was a member of NMSU's Outcomes Assessment Committee for three years and chaired the committee for an additional three years. During that time, Dr. Rushforth evaluated dozens of university programs and departments. He currently instructs for NMSU and Ndé Bizaa, the Mescalero Apache Tribe Language Program. He also teaches Apache linguistics for ALTs. Dr. Rushforth will continue these activities during the period of DOE funding and will work closely with ALTs in the development of Apache language literacy materials.

C. PROJECT MANAGEMENT PLAN (30 POINTS)

Program Responsibilities, Timeline, and Milestones for Accomplishing Project Tasks. We first present our management plan in the form of a table that specifies tasks, purposes, timelines, milestones, and responsible persons. After this, we present a table that summarizes the current MAS English Language Proficiency School-Wide Action Plan. Together, the two tables represent our project management plan.

In the following table, we use these abbreviations when specifying persons responsible for program activities and products: School Board (SB), School District Superintendent (SDS), Tribal Administration (TA), Program Director (PD), Apache Language Teachers (ALT), Apache Language Resource Specialist (ALRS), Indigenous Language Consultant (ILC), English Language Evaluator (ELE), Apache Language Evaluator (ALE), Apache Linguistics Instructor (ALI), Apache Language Consultants (ALC), Parents and Guardians (PG), and Mescalero Apache Tribe Language Program (Ndé Bizaa). All scheduling information refers explicitly to the period during which MAS receives DOE funding.

**PROGRAM RESPONSIBILITIES, TIMELINE, AND MILESTONES FOR
ACCOMPLISHING PROJECT TASKS**

Tasks	Purpose	Timeline: Milestones	Responsible Persons
Attend School Board and Tribal Council meetings.	Notify tribal leaders about funding.	Month One: task completed.	PD, SB, SDS, TA
Convene stakeholder meeting.	Notify Mescalero community about funding.	Month One: task completed.	PD, SB, SDS, TA, ALT, MAS Learning Community
Post job, interview, and hire ALT.	Hire necessary program staff.	Month One: task completed.	PD, SB, SDS
Post job, interview, and hire ALRS.	Hire necessary program staff.	Month One: task completed.	PD, SB, SDS
Contract ALE.	Hire necessary program staff.	Month One: task completed.	PD, SB, SDS
Purchase equipment and supplies.	Obtain equipment and supplies necessary to the program.	Month One and as Needed Thereafter: task initiated and on-going.	PD, SB, SDS, ALRS
Convene initial program staff orientation meeting.	Work with staff to confirm program goals, strategies, and assessments.	Month One: task completed.	PD, SB, SDS, ALT, ELE
Conduct initial on-site program evaluation.	Establish baseline for program evaluation.	Month Three: task initiated and completed.	ALE, ELE
Convene first staff in-service meeting with ELE and ALE.	Review evaluation goals, strategies, and procedures.	Month Three: task initiated and completed.	ALE, ELE, PD, SB, SDS, ALT, ALRS
Receive first evaluation report from ALE.	Establish baseline for program evaluation.	Month Four: task completed.	ALE, PD, SB, SDS, ALT, ALRS

PROGRAM RESPONSIBILITIES, TIMELINE, AND MILESTONES FOR ACCOMPLISHING PROJECT TASKS			
Tasks	Purpose	Timeline: Milestones	Responsible Persons
Conduct bi-annual on-site program evaluation.	On-going program evaluation.	Bi-annually (Fall and Spring Semesters): task initiated and completed twice each year.	ALE
Receive and evaluate bi-annual ALE evaluation report.	On-going program evaluation.	Bi-annually (Fall and Spring Semesters): task initiated and completed twice each year.	ALE, PD, SB, SDS, ALT, ALRS
Convene bi-annual in-service meeting with ALE.	Review external evaluation and implement needed program changes.	Bi-annually (Fall and Spring Semesters): task initiated and completed twice each year.	ALE, PD, SB, SDS, ALT, ALRS
Convene summer curriculum development and instruction workshop.	Develop Apache language curriculum and language materials for MAS. Enhance Apache language instruction techniques.	Two Weeks During June: task initiated and completed each year.	PD, ALT, ALRS, ILC
Convene curriculum and lesson planning session.	Develop Apache language curriculum and language materials for MAS.	Daily During School Year: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS
Work with ALT (Elders and Storytellers) to record Apache language oral literature, history, and other educational materials.	Develop Apache language curriculum and language materials for MAS.	Month Two and Each Month Thereafter: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS, ALE, Ndé Bizaa, ALC

**PROGRAM RESPONSIBILITIES, TIMELINE, AND MILESTONES FOR
ACCOMPLISHING PROJECT TASKS**

Tasks	Purpose	Timeline: Milestones	Responsible Persons
Convene joint MAS Apache Language Program and MAS Reading Program meetings, workshops, and trainings.	Enhance cooperation between the two programs. Confirm shared goals, strategies, and assessments.	Month Two and Monthly Thereafter: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS, MAS Reading Program Staff (MAS Learning Community)
Parent and Guardian school-wide activities.	Enhance Mescalero community, parent, and guardian involvement at MAS.	Month Two and Monthly Thereafter: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS, PG (MAS Learning Community)
Parent and Guardian classroom activities.	Enhance Mescalero community, parent, and guardian involvement at MAS.	Weekly: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS, PG (MAS Learning Community)
Conduct MAS Cultural Week.	Enhance Mescalero community, parent, and guardian involvement at MAS.	One Week During April: task initiated and completed each year.	PD, ALT, ALRS, PG (MAS Learning Community)
Conduct on-site Apache Linguistics Classes.	Professional learning community development.	Twice Weekly During the School Year: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS, ALI, Ndé Bizaa
Travel to regional and national professional meetings.	Professional Learning Community development.	As Scheduled by Regional and National Professional Organizations: task initiated and completed each time.	PD, ALT, ALRS,

**PROGRAM RESPONSIBILITIES, TIMELINE, AND MILESTONES FOR
ACCOMPLISHING PROJECT TASKS**

Tasks	Purpose	Timeline: Milestones	Responsible Persons
Travel to regional universities and Indian reservations for classes, workshops, institutes, and school site visits.	Professional learning community development.	Twice Annually (Fall and Spring Semesters): task initiated and completed twice each year.	PD, ALT, ALRS,
Conduct NMSBA language proficiency testing.	Student and program evaluation.	Annually (Spring Semester): task initiated and completed each year.	PD, ALT, ALRS, MAS Councilors
Conduct ACCESS for ELLs language proficiency testing.	Student and program evaluation.	Annually (Spring Semester): task initiated and completed each year.	PD, ALT, ALRS, MAS Councilors
Complete grant reporting functions.	Meet required administrative and reporting functions.	Quarterly and Annually: task initiated and completed each year.	PD, SB, SDS
Implement new Apache language curriculum and instruction.	Incorporate new materials, lessons, and activities designed to meet program goals.	Daily During the School Year: task initiated and on-going.	ALT
Prepare new Apache language curriculum and instructional materials (including hard copy texts, audio CDs, video DVDs, and web-based materials).	Incorporate new Apache language materials, lessons, and activities designed to meet program goals.	Daily During the School Year: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS
Teach Apache language conversation and literacy to parents, guardians, and other stakeholders.	Enhance Mescalero community and parental involvement at MAS.	Twice Weekly During the School Year: task initiated and on-going.	ALT, Ndé Bizaa, PG (MAS Learning Community)

PROGRAM RESPONSIBILITIES, TIMELINE, AND MILESTONES FOR ACCOMPLISHING PROJECT TASKS			
Tasks	Purpose	Timeline: Milestones	Responsible Persons
Distribute Apache language materials to stakeholders.	Enhance Mescalero community and parental involvement at MAS.	During the School Year: task initiated and on-going.	PD, ALT, ALRS (MAS Learning Community)
Conduct year-end assessment of MAS student Apache language fluency and literacy. Administer ALSA.	Student and program evaluation.	Annually (Spring Semester): task initiated and completed each year.	PD, ALT, ALRS, ALE
Evaluate annual results of Apache fluency and literacy test.	Student and program evaluation.	Annually (Fall Semester): task initiated and completed each year.	ALE, PD, SB, SDS, ALT, ALRS

As noted, an important an important part of our strategy is to enhance cooperation and collaboration between the Apache Language Program and the MAS Reading Program. This necessitates that the Apache Language Program organize its Apache language literacy activities according to the MAS English Language Proficiency School-Wide Action Plan, prepared under the guidance of the BIE, MAS Administration, and Reading Program personnel. The following Language Proficiency Action Plan provides additional information about our Project Management Plan.

MAS ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY SCHOOL-WIDE ACTION PLAN				
(Revised 09-10)				
Area for Action Plan	School-wide Plans for Each Area	Action to Be Taken	Person Responsible	Report on Progress of Implementation

MAS ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY SCHOOL-WIDE ACTION PLAN

(Revised 09-10)

Area for Action Plan	School-wide Plans for Each Area	Action to Be Taken	Person Responsible	Report on Progress of Implementation
Materials and Instructional Practices	Core-Reading Mastery Signature Intensive Intervention – Read Naturally and re-teach stories	Classes will begin and end on time. Teachers will keep a pace when presenting so that they will keep lessons interesting. All staff members will have appropriate instructional materials.	Reading Group Teachers, Reading Coach	Teachers will pick up new textbooks and materials as needed. Trainings are on-going. Coaching in practices is on-going.
Time, Coverage, Mastery and Grouping Practices	90 minutes to 2 ½ hour reading blocks. Students in small groups by ability level. Fidelity to the program.	Basic Reading Block is 90 minutes. A 30 minute intervention time, either adjacent to the reading block or another time during the day. Intensive intervention takes place while strategic and benchmark students go to an SMR lab. Students are re-grouped as needed.	All teachers in each grade level, Coach, Principal, Tutors, all Reading Teachers	On-going
Assessment Practices	DIBELS READING MASTERY	DIBELS TESTS: Intensive – Weekly Strategic – Every second week.	Homeroom Teachers, SpEd Teachers,	All teachers have received training for testing their own students.

MAS ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY SCHOOL-WIDE ACTION PLAN

(Revised 09-10)

Area for Action Plan	School-wide Plans for Each Area	Action to Be Taken	Person Responsible	Report on Progress of Implementation
	Checkouts Mastery Tests Curriculum Based Assessment STAR test NWEA	Benchmark – first full week of each month. Checkout: End of each 5 lessons. Mastery Tests: End of each 10 lessons Grades 2-5. Curriculum Based Assessment: After Lessons 20, 40, 60, etc. On computer at beginning and end of year. On computer end of year.	Reading Group Teachers	On-going test results. Year end assessment.
Data Utilization Practices	Examination of DIBELS, READING MASTERY Checkouts, and Mastery scores Review STAR results	After testing each week the coach puts the test scores into a form the teachers can understand in relation to the entire grade. At weekly meetings teachers go over this information to see who is advancing or regressing. Changes may be made in grouping when the testing verifies teacher observations.	Coach	On-going

MAS ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY SCHOOL-WIDE ACTION PLAN

(Revised 09-10)

Area for Action Plan	School-wide Plans for Each Area	Action to Be Taken	Person Responsible	Report on Progress of Implementation
Professional Development	5-minute Walk Through. Technical Consultant. Best Teacher Practices. Correction Procedures. Monitoring while teaching. Proper correction every error.	Follow program implementation. Fidelity to the program. Technical Consultant coaching. Giving updates to BIE, Technical Coach, Superintendent, School Board, and PET meetings.	Technical Coach, Principal, Reading Teachers	On-going
School-wide Organization and Support	School Board. Superintendent. Parent Education Team (all parents who want to be involved). Principal. Coaches. Classroom Teachers. Title I money for intervention programs. SpEd Dept – TAs are teaching reading group.	Giving updates to all involved. Students Walk to Read Weekly meetings (or in some cases almost daily meetings) for collaboration. Tutoring program for RIL Lab. Tutoring program for after school.	Technical Coach, Principal, Reading Teachers	On-going

MAS ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY SCHOOL-WIDE ACTION PLAN

(Revised 09-10)

Area for Action Plan	School-wide Plans for Each Area	Action to Be Taken	Person Responsible	Report on Progress of Implementation
School Leadership: Principal	Principal	Continue to require fidelity to the program. Attend required meetings and conferences. 5 minute walk-through. Meet with grade level staff weekly.	Principal	On-going
BIE Reading Coach	Coach	Continue to require fidelity to the program. Attend required meetings and conferences. 5 minute walk-through. Meet with grade level staff on weekly basis.	Technical Coach, Principal, Reading Teachers	On-going

Adequacy of Plan to Achieve Proposed Project Goals within Budget. The Project Management Plan we propose is adequate to accomplish all project goals within the requested budget. All our specified objectives are realistic and manageable on schedule. We identify persons responsible for each task and will hold them accountable. No proposed activity is over-funded or under-funded. We provide thorough description of and justification for our proposed budget in the appropriate section of this proposal.

D. PROJECT EVALUATION (30 POINTS)

To begin, each of the strategic activities identified in section A of this proposal has well-defined objectives, outcomes, and measurements. We will not repeat our discussion of such things discussion here. In this section, we are concerned with objective measurement of primary project goals.

Methods (5 points). As noted, we designed the Mescalero Apache School Language Proficiency Project to accomplish three main goals, each of which we will measure in an objective and quantifiable manner: **Goal 1:** Increase the English Language Proficiency of MAS Students. **Goal 2:** Increase the Apache Language Proficiency of MAS Students. **Goal 3:** Increase the Preparedness of MAS Students for Post-secondary Education and Training.

Our evaluation plan incorporates the following characteristics, as required by the BIE: (1) an assessment system for all students (a method for determining the proficiency of all students); (2) an ability to collect and analyze data; (3) a method for determining the severity of student proficiency problems; (4) a method for determining why the problem is happening; (5) a protocol for early intervention; (6) a continuum of scientifically-researched and evidence-based interventions; (7) teachers skilled to instruct differentially to the needs of the group; (8) continuous progress monitoring; (9) data-based decision-making and problem-solving; (10) frequent review of student performance; and (11) implementation with fidelity.

Under these guidelines, we will objectively measure outcomes using tests and procedures now employed by the State of New Mexico and by the Mescalero Apache Schools, including the NMSBA, ACCESS for ELLs, and the Apache Language Skills Assessment (ALSA).

NMSBA. NMSBA is the core testing component of New Mexico's Educational Benchmarks and Performance Standards. The Language Arts Content Standards, Benchmarks, and Performance Standards have been designed to: (1) describe the disciplinary content and

skills students should learn at specific grade levels, (2) help teachers create classroom instruction and authentic assessments that address a substantive core curriculum that can be applied to student successes across all disciplines, and (3) serve as the basis for a statewide assessment of student learning. The MAS administers this test every spring to students in selected grade levels. The State of NM compiles test results and provides them to schools in early summer.

ACCESS for ELLs. The MAS administers ACCESS for ELLs each spring to ELL students (which includes the entire student body). This test addresses academic ELL standards at the core of the World Class Instructional Design and Assessment (WIDA) Consortium's approach to instructing and evaluating the progress of ELLs. WIDA standards incorporate a set of model performance indicators that describe expectations educators have of students at four different grade level clusters and in five different content areas.

ALSA. We use the Apache Language Skills Assessment to measure our students' Apache language proficiency. We developed ALSA based on the Stanford Foreign Language Oral Skills Evaluation Matrix, a standard assessment tool used by World Languages teachers nation-wide. ALSA measures pronunciation, fluency, vocabulary, comprehension, and grammar. We use ALSA for indexing growth in Mescalero Apache language proficiency within and across instructional levels. ALSA provides assessment through six levels of proficiency, from Level 1 (Beginner) to Level 6 (Fluent).

APACHE LANGUAGE SKILLS ASSESSMENT					
Level	Pronunciation	Vocabulary	Fluency	Comprehension	Grammar
1	Exhibits difficulty in accurately reproducing sounds and	Vocabulary limited to: (a) high frequency words for common items	Participates in formulaic question-answer patterns and/or offering	Recognizes a limited number of high frequency words in isolation and short,	Difficult or impossible to assess knowledge of grammar.

APACHE LANGUAGE SKILLS ASSESSMENT

Level	Pronunciation	Vocabulary	Fluency	Comprehension	Grammar
	sound patterns.	and actions, and (b) some idiomatic expressions.	very short responses to simple questions.	common conversational expressions.	
2	Difficulty with many sounds, making meaning unclear.	Vocabulary limited to simple statements and questions about concrete things in a simplified conversation.	Frequently pauses to formulate short, simple non-formulaic statements and questions.	Understands short questions and simple non-formulaic statements at less than normal speed when they are embedded in a short dialogue or passage.	Grammatical errors are present.
3	Beginning to demonstrate control over many sounds and sound patterns.	Adequate working vocabulary. Beginning knowledge of synonyms.	Able to engage in conversation using simple language. Consistently falters and hesitates using more complex ideas and less common words.	Comprehends the main point(s) of a short dialogue which contains embedded structures heard at less than normal speed, though it is likely that details will be lost.	Limited ability to utilize a few complex constructions, not always successfully. Other grammatical errors persist which may make meaning ambiguous.
4	Speech is always intelligible.	Demonstrates knowledge of synonyms, alternative ways of	Able mostly effortlessly to express ideas. Occasionally falters and	Comprehends dialogue which contains abstract information heard at almost normal	Almost consistent command over a limited range of more complex patterns and